

**LONDON BOROUGH OF TOWER HAMLETS
COMMUNITY SAFETY PARTNERSHIP**

**DOMESTIC HOMICIDE REVIEW
MS CAALIYAH D AGED 39 YEARS
KILLED IN DECEMBER 2014**

**REVIEW PANEL CHAIR AND AUTHOR
BILL GRIFFITHS CBE BEM QPM**

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

CONTENTS

	Paragraph No	Page No
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY		3
INTRODUCTION	1 - 24	6
Management of the review	7 - 10	6
Table 1 – Agencies and records of relevant contact/timeline	9	7
Policy research	12 - 13	9
Comparative case analysis	14	10
Family and friends	15 - 20	10
The Perpetrator	21	11
Police investigation and Coroner	22	11
Equality Act 2010	23	11
Confidentiality	24	11
THE FACTS	25 - 57	12
Family background	25 - 26	12
Ms Caaliyah D	27 - 35	12
Mr Yasir Z	36 - 37	13
Domestic incidents in Leeds	38 – 46	13
Domestic incidents in Tower Hamlets	47 – 57	15
ANALYSIS	58 - 67	17
CONCLUSIONS AND LESSONS LEARNED	68 - 82	18
RECOMMENDATIONS	83 - 87	20
Glossary		22
Distribution List		23
APPENDICES		
Appendix 1 – Independents statements		24
Appendix 2 – Panel members		25
Appendix 3 – Terms of reference for review		26
Appendix 4 - Action plan		29

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This summary outlines the process taken by the London Borough of Tower Hamlets (LBTH) Domestic Violence Homicide Review Panel established on 20 April 2015 under s9 Domestic Violence, Crime and Victims Act 2004, independently chaired by Bill Griffiths CBE BEM QPM, to review the death of Ms Caaliyah D aged 39 caused by multiple stab wounds in late December 2014. In July 2015, her brother, Mr Yasir Z aged 34, was convicted of her manslaughter at the Central Criminal Court and sentenced to 14 years' imprisonment.

The process began with a meeting on 14 May 2015 of all agencies that potentially had contact with the family prior to the death of Caaliyah D. Agencies participating in the review are:

- NHS England (Burmantofts Health Centre, Leeds, Health E1 Primary Care Centre, LBTH, The Spitalfields Practice, LBTH)
- Leeds Teaching Hospital
- Barts Hospital Trust
- West Yorkshire Police
- Metropolitan Police
- LBTH Adult Social Care
- MIND in Tower Hamlets and Newham
- LBTH Housing Options
- LBTH Domestic Violence and Hate Crime Team

Agencies were asked to give chronological accounts of their contact with the victim prior to her death. Each agency's report covered the following:

A chronology of interaction with the victim and the perpetrator; what was done or agreed; and whether internal procedures were followed.

The accounts of involvement with this victim cover different periods of time prior to their death. Some of the accounts have more significance than others. The extent to which the key areas have been covered and the format in which they have been presented varies between agencies. Of the above agencies, only West Yorkshire Police were involved relevant to the purpose of the review and subsequently provided a full Individual Management Review that included conclusions and recommendations from the agency's point of view.

In addition, the Chief Executive of Kingston Race and Equalities Council was invited to provide independent cultural advice to the Panel.

Key issues arising from the review

Caaliyah D arrived in the UK from Somalia in 1999, initially residing with her mother and siblings in Leeds. She subsequently moved to the London Borough of Tower Hamlets where, for the next 15 years, she lived mostly a solitary and peaceful life. Caaliyah was devoted to her Sunni Muslim faith, regularly attending the London Muslim Centre. She was slight in stature and had suffered chronic musculoskeletal pain for most of her life and from vitamin D deficiency for which she received supplements.

Her younger brother, Yasir Z, had travelled to join the family in Leeds in 2009 and it seems that he had been injured as well as traumatised by the civil war in Somalia and may have suffered thus from mental health symptoms, such as depression, anxiety and short temper.

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

There had been three low level incidents at the family home in Leeds during 2010-11 recorded by police, one involving the two of them, one between Yasir and their elder brother Mr Aaden B that Caaliyah witnessed and another with just the two brothers. None of the incidents involved violence although it had been threatened. The common denominator was Yasir.

The only connection between the Leeds events and the death of Caaliyah in London is the reference to boiling water in the original call to police by Yasir for the second incident in July 2011 and his self-defence case for the murder charge that, in any event, was not accepted by the trial Jury.

Following the demise of their mother, Caaliyah's elder brother, Aaden, had moved to a neighbouring London Borough in August 2014. And when Yasir subsequently broke up with his partner in Leeds, he too came to London in late December 2014 and moved in with Caaliyah for the five days preceding her death.

On the second day, Yasir Z had sought housing from local services, saying that he was homeless having broken up with his partner in Leeds. He provided Caaliyah's address as his temporary location with friends and did not disclose it was in fact his sister's home. He did not meet the necessary criteria for homelessness so was not offered accommodation.

The visit had started badly with an argument between him and Aaden at Kings Cross Station and Caaliyah reported to Aaden at Friday prayers [four days later] that the stay was not working and Yasir had threatened to kill her rather than move out. Aaden spoke to his brother who promised to calm down and be respectful to his sister and the fact that he was a guest at her home. By the next day (Saturday), Caaliyah informed Aaden by telephone that she had issued an ultimatum or 'deadline' to Yasir that he should be out of her flat by the morning of the following Monday. Yasir undertook to seek accommodation the next morning (Sunday).

None of these developments were reported or known to safeguarding agencies in Tower Hamlets until an emergency call from Yasir late on the next day to report that Caaliyah had been fatally injured. Despite sustained efforts by paramedics and the HEMS doctors, Caaliyah's injuries were so severe she was beyond saving. Police detained Yasir at the scene.

The family is represented by Aaden, older brother to both siblings, but he declined to take up the opportunity to engage with the DHR process, making his position clear that the death of his sister is the will of Allah and he will focus on forgiveness for his brother and his release from prison. While disappointed with this missing insight to the life of Caaliyah, the Panel acknowledge that Aaden has suffered a double tragedy and offer him our condolences.

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

Conclusions and recommendations from the review

Taken together, the three relatively minor domestic incidents recorded in Leeds between December 2010 and August 2011 provide some learning locally for West Yorkshire Police with respect to the linking and classification of incidents:

- Missed opportunities to make a notification or referral to Adult Social Care
- The second incident should have been recorded as a domestic incident
- A pattern of repeat incidents involving the family was not identified

Recommendation 1

West Yorkshire Police ensures that all police officers and staff are reminded of the importance of making Adult Safeguarding notifications or referrals to Adult Social Care in circumstances where a Vulnerable Adult is known to be resident (full or part time) within an environment where domestic abuse is identified

From events in Tower Hamlets, it can safely be concluded that there was no opportunity presented to safeguarding agencies to take preventative action with respect to the burgeoning friction between Caaliyah and her younger brother over the five days he lodged with her in December 2014. While it is apparent that Yasir subjected Caaliyah to domestic abuse, including controlling and coercive behavior, in that period, no clear evidence emerged that this was other than an exception in her general experience of domestic life.

Nonetheless, given Caaliyah's devotion to her faith, it is appropriate to review the information available to women attending Mosques, the London Muslim Centre in particular, as to how to access domestic abuse services such as offered in the Tower Hamlets service directory, including when concerned for a sister worshipper. This learning also provides an opportunity to re-invigorate awareness at all current and potential Third Party Reporting Centres within the Borough.

Recommendation 2

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership provide an outline of the learning from this review, suitably anonymised, to promote further the encouragement of personal and third party reporting of domestic abuse within Tower Hamlets, specifically within the Somali community

OVERVIEW REPORT

INTRODUCTION

1. On a Saturday in late December 2014 at 22.14 paramedics and police were called to a tower block flat in Commercial Street, London E1 where Ms Caaliyah D aged 39 (born October 1974 in Somalia) was discovered with fatal knife wounds. Arrested at the scene and subsequently charged with her murder was her brother, Mr Yasir Z aged 34 (born April 1980 in Somalia). In July 2015 at the Central Criminal Court, Yasir Z was convicted of the manslaughter of his sister and sentenced to 14 years' imprisonment.
2. There are no prior reports of domestic abuse recorded in Tower Hamlets but there are three police reports of domestic disputes between them and their elder brother, Mr Aaden B (born October 1968), between December 2010 and August 2011 when they either resided or were visiting their mother in Burmantofts, Leeds.
3. Under s9 Domestic Violence, Crime and Victims Act 2004, a Domestic Violence Homicide Review (DVHR) was commissioned by Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership and, on 20 April 2015, Mr Bill Griffiths CBE BEM QPM was appointed Independent Chair of the DVHR Panel. Tony Hester supported him throughout in the role of Secretary to the Panel. Their respective background and 'independence statements' are attached at appendix 1.
4. The first Panel meeting was held on 14 May with the membership and agencies represented as shown in appendix 2. Following discussion of a draft, Terms of Reference were issued on the same day (appendix 3).
5. While apportioning blame is not the purpose of a review under this legislation, opening a window on the system and conducting analysis of what has happened, should provide learning for the safeguarding agencies and any recommendations from the Panel should identify opportunities to make improvement to systems. Forensic and non-judgmental consideration that identifies why services may have been less effective than intended can and should inform how to more proactively reduce harm to those at risk and what change is needed to improve vital safeguarding services.
6. A specific operating principle for the review has been to be guided by humanity, compassion and empathy, with Caaliyah D's voice at the heart of the process.

Management of the review

7. For ease of reference, all terms suitable for acronym will appear once in full and there is also a glossary at the end of the report. The deceased Ms Caaliyah D may also be referred to by her first name and the letters CD where appropriate to the narrative. Similarly, her elder brother may be referred to as Aaden B, Aaden or AB, her sister Ms Faduma E, Faduma or FE and the perpetrator, also her younger brother as Mr Yasir Z, Yasir or YZ.
8. This review report is an anthology of information and facts from the organisations represented on the Panel, most of which were potential support agencies for both Caaliyah and Yasir.

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

From the table below it may be noted that eight agencies have records of relevant contact with the deceased and her brother during the period since their respective arrivals in the UK up to the homicide of Caaliyah in late December 2014.

9. *Table 1 – Agencies and records of relevant contact in the order that it occurred*

Contact period	Agency	Summary of contact
March/99 to Dec/00	Burmantofts Health Centre, Leeds	Provided primary health care services from the time CD entered the UK until she moved to London
Jan/01 to July/03	Health E1 Primary Care Centre, Brick Lane E1	Provided primary health care during her stay at a hostel in Tower Hamlets
Aug/03 to Dec/14	The Spitalfields Practice, Old Montague Street, E1	Provided primary health care from the time CD moved to Commercial Street up to the time of her death Frequent attendances with chronic musculoskeletal pain, weakness, weight loss, poor weight gain and recurrent indigestion Apart from vitamin D deficiency for which supplements were provided, all investigations were essentially normal
May/05 to Aug/11	West Yorkshire Police (WYP)	There are four domestic incidents reported to police during 2005-07. Each involves AB and his niece who was a teenager under his guardianship. CD was not involved and YZ had yet to enter UK. The Panel concluded that these matters are outside of the scope of this review Three domestic incidents were attended by police at the family address in Burmantofts, Leeds in 2010-11: Dec/10 – argument between YZ and AB July/11 – disagreement between YZ and CD as to whom should carry out the shopping for their disabled mother August/11 – argument between YZ and AB regarding the care of their mother. CD is recorded as present
Feb/09	Metropolitan Police Service (MPS)	CD was arrested for an offence of criminal damage following an argument over her bus pass in which she ripped the jacket pocket of the ticket inspector whilst trying to retrieve it. Following interview with the aid of an interpreter, CD

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

Dec/14		<p>accepted a police caution.</p> <p>Police and paramedics called to home address where CD found with fatal stab injuries and YZ detained</p>
May/10	Leeds Teaching Hospital	<p>CD seen by Spitalfields GP in May/10 for pain in thigh following fall and described as ‘cachectic’ Travelled to Leeds and attended A&E with AB but not admitted and declined to wait for further investigations</p>
Jan/14 to April/14	Barts Hospital Trust	<p>In Jan/14 and April/14 CD attended A&E having twice fallen when a bus driver braked suddenly Diagnosis of soft tissue injury on both occasions and no treatment given</p>
Nov/11 to Dec/14	Tower Hamlets Adult Social Care	<p>In Nov/11 CD referred by Housing Officer in email to request assistance with washing herself in the bath due to rheumatic pains in arms and back File closed in Jan/12 as no response to letters and phone messages In April/13 2nd referral by Housing Officer and, for same reasons, file closed in May/13 In Nov/14 brother AB contacts direct with request for a wet room to be fitted on behalf of CD and home visit assessment in Nov/14 CD declined offer of bath board and bath seat Grab rail and shoe horn provided</p>
Oct/13 to Nov/13	MIND in Tower Hamlets and Newham	<p>In Oct/13 CD disclosed to a friend at the London Muslim Centre (LMC) that she needed help with her benefit payments. An appointment was made but CD did not attend</p>
Dec/14	Tower Hamlets Housing Options	<p>YZ approached HOST (Housing Options Singles Team) for assistance as homeless Had been living with partner in Leeds between Sep/14 and [day before moving in with CD] and due to relationship breakdown had left¹ Living with ‘friends’ at [CD’s flat] but felt he was getting in the way Advised that, as no serious medical or mental health problems and no support needs, was not eligible for assistance Provided with access to private accommodation information</p>

¹ Enquiries show that Yasir was the sole occupant registered at the Leeds address

--	--	--

10. Each agency has provided a chronology [Note: Provided by NHS England as one chronology and summary analysis with respect to CD]. The Panel considered these in a single integrated chronology. Subsequently, West Yorkshire Police provided a full Individual Management Review (IMR). Other local agencies involved with the response to domestic abuse have checked their records and have found no trace of any of the parties involved in this review.
11. In addition, Mr John Azah OBE, Chief Executive of Kingston Race and Equalities Council was invited to attend the Panel and provided independent cultural advice.

Policy Research

12. This review was commissioned under Home Office Guidance issued in August 2013. The agreed cross-government definition of domestic violence and abuse should aid the learning from this review and is set out here in full:

“Any incident or pattern of incidents of controlling, coercive or threatening behaviour, violence or abuse between those aged 16 or over who are or have been intimate partners or family members regardless of gender or sexuality. This can encompass, but is not limited to, the following types of abuse:

psychological

physical

sexual

financial

emotional

Controlling behaviour is: a range of acts designed to make a person subordinate and/or dependent by isolating them from sources of support, exploiting their resources and capacities for personal gain, depriving them of the means needed for independence, resistance and escape and regulating their everyday behaviour.

Coercive behaviour is: an act or a pattern of acts of assault, threats, humiliation and intimidation or other abuse that is used to harm, punish, or frighten their victim.”

13. The following policies and initiatives have also been supplied and scrutinised:
- Multi-agency Statutory Guidance for the Conduct of Domestic Homicide Reviews published by the Home Office August 2013
 - Domestic Homicide Reviews: Common Themes Identified as Lessons to be Learned published by Home Office November 2013
 - MPS Domestic Violence Investigation and Supervisors Toolkit issued in July 2013
 - WYP Domestic Abuse Policy revisions 2011 to 2015
 - Protecting Adults at risk: London multi-agency policy and procedures to safeguard adults from abuse (Social Care Institute for Excellence (SCIE) Report 39)
 - HMIC (Her Majesty’s Inspectorate of Constabulary) Reports: ‘Everyone’s business: Improving the police response to domestic abuse’ 2014 and the specific reviews of the West Yorkshire Police and Metropolitan Police approach to tackling domestic abuse 2014

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

- Tower Hamlets Council website: ‘What is Domestic Abuse?’ and the service directory published in March 2014

Comparative case analysis

14. There have been three DVHR cases reported and completed in the London Borough of Tower Hamlets since the legislation and prior to this case. Details have been provided to the Chair who has concluded that, in the circumstances of this case, including the lack of prior contact with safeguarding agencies in the five days that Yasir was living with Caaliyah in Tower Hamlets, there are no parallels to be drawn with this review.

Family and friends

15. The only relative available in the UK is Aaden B, the older brother of both parties, who was a witness at the trial. Since the trial, he has been approached via the police family liaison officer and his position is that he does not wish to contribute to the review for these reasons, that he set out by an email addressed to the Chair:

- As a Muslim, when someone dies they should be buried as soon as possible
- Be patient and tolerant and pray for the person who has passed away
- My sister has passed away and it is needless to ask me anything or talk about my sister – I am praying for her, nothing else
- On the other hand if the Home Office wants to talk about my brother and how they could help get grounds for an appeal it would be helpful in order to release him from prison
- Because he is alive and what happened is the cause of Allah and was not his intention
- My brother has anxiety and mental problems and was not given the right treatment when in Leeds
- No one is blaming or accusing my brother of anything ... as this is within the family and has been forgiven and forgiveness is the best way to [bring about] a solution

16. On the face of it, this is a somewhat callous view upon the loss of a sister, combined with overt support clearly expressed for their brother who had admitted responsibility for her violent death, albeit his case was that he had been defending himself from an attack by her.

17. The Panel did debate whether Aaden B's expressed view is a manifestation of honour-based abuse and if an inference could be drawn that his words reveal a family or community culture conducive to control or coercion in the domestic setting experienced by Caaliyah. Specifically, the Panel considered whether it was feasible to approach Aaden B for further insight as to what had happened and why. It was concluded that (a) he is not compellable in this process and a further request may well exacerbate his grief, and (b) from what he had written above, together with his strong repudiation of the trial, verdict and sentence of his brother as expressed to the investigators and prosecutors afterwards, the likelihood of further insight from such contact is very small.

18. Aaden's approach is certainly concerning; but it should be comprehended from the perspective of a brother who has experienced the double tragedy of the loss of his sister and the imprisonment of his brother. The Panel do offer him our condolences.

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

19. The search for friends that may have contributed to the knowledge of what was happening in Caaliyah's life was also limited. Aside from daily attendance for prayers at the London Muslim Centre, Caaliyah appears to have led a solitary life and was not in employment. In October 2013, a friend of hers from the London Muslim Centre contacted MIND in Tower Hamlets and Newham seeking help for her with benefit payments. Caaliyah did not attend the appointment that was made, apparently because the concern had been resolved. Enquiries by the police homicide investigation team have not identified any other potential source of information.
20. On behalf of the Panel, a direct inquiry with the London Muslim Centre and the Female Projects Manager has confirmed that Caaliyah D was a regular attendee at the women's area and would gather with other Somali worshippers. She was a pleasant character, always greeting people nicely. She had been particularly happy in the weeks before her death because issues around her benefit payments had been resolved. Contact records and the counseling database for the Mosque have been checked and there is no trace of Caaliyah noted there. News of her death is said to be a great shock to the female Somali worshippers.

The Perpetrator

21. The Chair contacted the Governor for the establishment of Her Majesty's Prison Service where Yasir Z is serving sentence with the request for a visit and interview to provide his perspective on learning for safeguarding agencies. In December 2015, he formally declined this opportunity to contribute to the review.

Police investigation and Coroner

22. The Chair set up liaison with the Investigating Officer (IO) to ensure the judicial process was effectively managed. The Coroner has decided that the trial and verdict in this case means that an Inquest into the death of Ms Caaliyah D will not be necessary.

Equality Act 2010

23. Consideration has been given to the nine protected characteristics under the Act in evaluating the various services provided. All concerned are Black African by heritage and Sunni Muslim by faith. Caaliyah is female and unmarried. Consideration has been given to whether Yasir meets the classification of 'adult at risk'².

Confidentiality

24. The Government Protective Marking Scheme (GPMS) was adopted throughout with a rating of "Official-Sensitive" for shared material. Either secure networks were in place (gsi, pnn) and adopted (cjsm) or papers shared with password protection.

² Formerly known as a 'Vulnerable Adult'

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

THE FACTS

Family background

25. Ms Caaliyah D and Mr Yasir Z are siblings (of seven) from Somalia, four of which have variously entered the United Kingdom and lived with their mother in Leeds. The family is practicing Sunni Muslim.
26. The eldest brother Mr Aaden B and sister Ms Faduma E were the first to arrive with their mother in 1993 and they resided in Burmantofts, Leeds. Caaliyah joined them in March 1999 and Yasir in November 2009. Faduma died in June 2002 and their mother in February 2014. In August 2014, Aaden moved to London and lived in a neighbouring Borough to his sister.

Ms Caaliyah D

27. Caaliyah D moved to the London Borough of Tower Hamlets in 2000 and, until 2003, stayed at a Salvation Army hostel known as 'Hopetown'. In 2003 she found rented accommodation at a tower block in Commercial Street, E1, in a single person's apartment that became the scene of her homicide. She was unmarried and not in a relationship. She was not in employment and depended on benefit payments. She attended the London Muslim Centre for prayers three to five times daily.
28. There are extensive medical records available of more than 100 GP consultations from 1999 to 2014 at three Primary Care Health Centres, one in Leeds and two in Tower Hamlets. In summary, Caaliyah suffered from chronic musculoskeletal pain, weakness, weight loss, poor weight gain and recurrent indigestion. Apart from vitamin D deficiency for which medication was provided, all investigations were essentially normal. There are no reports of domestic abuse contained in her medical records.
29. In May 2010, she was described as cachectic³ and referred to A&E for potential hospital admission for investigation, however, instead of attending her local hospital in London she travelled back to Leeds to access the Teaching Hospital A&E the following day accompanied by Aaden B. The A&E doctor advised further investigations but this was declined.
30. In February 2009, Caaliyah was travelling on a bus when a bus inspector confiscated her freedom pass as, for some unknown reason, it had been disabled. While attempting to retrieve the pass, she ripped the jacket pocket of the ticket inspector. A passing police patrol became involved in what had become a dispute and Caaliyah was arrested for the offence of causing criminal damage to the jacket. The Panel has debated whether this is relevant to the review and has included the event because it provides something of an insight to the challenge faced by Caaliyah in her daily life whilst coping with a poor command of English.
31. Following an interview with the aid of the duty solicitor and an interpreter, Caaliyah accepted a police caution. The custody record reveals that a brother was informed of her arrest but no detail written down. As Yasir was yet to have arrived in the UK this was, probably, Aaden. Both the arresting/interviewing officer and the custody officer have been traced and spoken to but neither can recall anything of the circumstances.

³ Loss of body mass that cannot be reversed nutritionally

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

32. In January 2014 and again in April, Caaliyah was referred to Bart's Hospital A&E following separate falls when standing on a bus that braked suddenly. On both occasions the diagnosis was soft tissue injury that did not require treatment. With the assistance of her elder brother, she had engaged a solicitor to seek compensation for injury in the accidents.
33. There was no history of mental health problems recorded or evidence of mental health concerns expressed. Caaliyah had poor command of English and this is documented to have affected her clinical consultations. She was frequently provided with an advocate or interpreter and Yasir is twice recorded as present in this capacity on her behalf.
34. Caaliyah was known to be cautious, careful and security conscious and that led to outwardly odd behaviour. For example, the police homicide investigation established that fellow residents at her block of flats noticed that she would press all the lift buttons for each floor in the tower block. Her brother has explained that this was so that any other person in the lift would not know what floor she was going to. If the other person did not alight from the lift before her floor, she would ride the lift to the very top and travel down again. She reasoned that, by this method, no one could ascertain which floor she lived on.
35. A written notebook was retrieved from her bedside table and translated as it may have provided a diary or other narrative helpful to the homicide investigation. It comprised only passages from the Koran. Caaliyah's home contained no photographs of her or her family.

Mr Yasir Z

36. In 1993 when aged 13, Yasir is said to have been shot and injured in the leg and to have witnessed the murder of his father during the civil war in Somalia. In 1994, he travelled to Kenya and lived there until 2003 when he moved to Ethiopia. He entered the United Kingdom in November 2009 and had leave to stay until March 2015. The war and death he has witnessed has affected his mental health and he suffers from depression and anxiety. He also has a very short temper. He is unmarried⁴.
37. He was registered and treated at the Burmantofts Health Centre apparently for mental health issues but there is no consent forthcoming for this to be assessed by NHS England for learning points. The presence of a mental health condition was not raised on his behalf by his defence team during the murder trial.

Domestic Incidents in Leeds

38. West Yorkshire Police have provided an IMR in which it is reported that police were called to incidents at the family home in Burmantofts, Leeds, on three occasions in 2010 and 11.

Incident 1 – involving Aaden and Yasir

39. In December 2010 Aaden called police because there had been a verbal argument with Yasir over an undisclosed matter. The dispute was resolved by Yasir being escorted from the home to the local police station for emergency accommodation to be found for him.

⁴ Source for this paragraph: His elder brother AB

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

40. In line with force domestic abuse policy at the time the report was assessed as a standard risk domestic abuse incident and a letter sent to Aaden setting out access to domestic abuse services if needed. Since 2010, forces have adopted the DASH (Domestic Abuse, Stalking and Honour based violence) risk assessment model in which the risk is assessed as standard, medium or high:

Standard – Current evidence does not indicate risk of causing serious harm

Medium – There are identifiable indicators of harm. The offender has the potential to cause serious harm but is unlikely to do so unless there is a change in circumstances, for example, failure to take medication, loss of accommodation, relationship breakdown and drug or alcohol abuse

High – There are identifiable indicators of serious harm. The potential event could happen at any time and the impact would be serious

Incident 2 – involving Yasir and Caaliyah

41. In July 2011, Yasir called police claiming that his sister was preventing him leaving the house to go shopping, had tried to kill him and had earlier tried to pour a kettle of boiling water over him. The incident was logged as a domestic related incident and the officers attended within seven minutes, compliant with Force policy.

42. It was soon ascertained that the dispute was over who should undertake the shopping on behalf of their elderly mother who was also present. No criminal allegations were disclosed at the scene and there were signs of injury or disturbance. The officers did not assess this attendance as a domestic incident and it cannot be confirmed if the original information about the threat by Caaliyah to kill Yasir or the attempt to pour boiling water on him was relayed to them via the radio system. Had such allegations been repeated at the scene, the officers are confident that this would have been recorded. The record of the call at the District Control Room indicates that they were provided with known antecedent information, with respect to incident 1 above, in advance of attendance.

43. The officers were asked for advice regarding the poor living conditions and noted rising damp in the hallway and the lack of furniture and they provided information about contact with the local Council. They did consider, but decided against, a referral to Adult Social Care in respect of the mother. Both Yasir and Caaliyah were given advice about the appropriateness of resorting to the emergency call system for such disputes. The argument was resolved by the officers providing Yasir with a lift to the shops.

44. The IMR author has identified that, had this incident been recorded as domestic related, further consideration may have been given to a referral to Adult Social Care with respect to the poor home conditions for the mother.

Incident 3 – involving Aaden and Yasir that was witnessed by Caaliyah

45. In August 2011 police were called by Yasir to an argument with Aaden over the care of their disabled mother and that his brother was trying to hit him. On arrival, the officers made use of the language line facility to establish with Yasir that there had been a verbal disagreement regarding the care of their mother and he was fearful that the situation would become out of control with Yasir becoming violent. Caaliyah, who must have been visiting her mother, was recorded as present during this incident but not involved in the dispute.

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

46. No criminal offences were disclosed. The incident was recorded as a verbal argument and domestic incident. The risk was assessed as ‘standard’ and consideration to be given to a referral to Adult Social Services if further incidents reported.

Domestic incidents in Tower Hamlets

47. On a Monday in late December 2014 at around 2030, Caaliyah and Aaden met Yasir at Kings Cross Station. Caaliyah had agreed that Yasir could stay at her flat until he found a place of his own in London. While at the station, Yasir became angry with Aaden “*For some reason*”⁵ and Aaden decided to leave.

48. The database for Tower Hamlets Housing Options Singles Team (HOST) has a record that, the next day (Tuesday), Yasir approached them for assistance as he was homeless. He had been living in Thealby Lawn, Leeds from September to December with his partner and had left due to a breakdown in the relationship. He had been staying with ‘friends’ [at the address for his sister] in Tower Hamlets. He was advised that, as he had no serious medical or mental health problems and no support needs, he was not eligible for assistance.

49. The three siblings met again four days later, on Friday at about 1400, for prayers at the London Muslim Centre. Caaliyah told her elder brother that she and Yasir had been arguing and that she wanted him to leave her flat. She further informed Aaden that when she said this to Yasir he had replied, “*If I leave, you will die*”⁶. Aaden told Yasir that he had to show respect for their sister and reminded him that it was her home. He told his younger brother to calm down and Yasir promised that he would act calmly and be respectful to Caaliyah.

50. The last time that Aaden spoke to his sister Caaliyah was the next day (Saturday). In a telephone call lasting seven minutes, he spoke to both siblings and could hear them arguing with each other during his call. It seems that Yasir was angry because the sound of Caaliyah cooking had woken him. Caaliyah told Aaden that she had informed Yasir that he had to leave her flat on the following Monday. Yasir told Aaden that he was going to attend Booth House, a Salvation Army hostel opposite the London Muslim Centre, to secure a place to stay.

51. Aaden arranged to meet Caaliyah the following morning. That meeting never took place because, later on the Saturday evening, Caaliyah was stabbed and killed by Yasir. There were no eyewitnesses.

52. That evening, at about 2240, the neighbour living above Caaliyah’s flat heard loud banging noises coming from below but does not recall any shouting. At 2244, Yasir made the first of two 999 calls that was terminated after 15 minutes followed by another a few moments later. The transcripts of the two calls reveal a male caller speaking in broken English.

53. He explained that his sister is on the floor bleeding, that she is not responding and that he has a cut hand. He explained further that the injuries occurred when his sister “*tried to attack me*” following an argument between them about her cooking whilst he was trying to sleep. Some 21

⁵ Source: Witness statement of AB

⁶ Ibid

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

minutes and 52 seconds into the calls, he is heard to say: *“I think it, dead, dead she’s dead”*. Moments later, the emergency services can be heard at the scene.

54. Paramedics and police officers had met outside and attended the scene together. The door to the flat was open and a small, serrated knife with bloodstains was nearby. Yasir was seen to be leaning over the body of his sister. He said, *“She attacked me with a knife”* and he was detained. Caaliyah was lying on her back in the kitchen with her legs protruding into the lounge. The kitchen floor was covered in water and blood and there was an overturned kettle on the floor. Despite best efforts to save her, Caaliyah’s injuries were too severe and she was pronounced dead at the scene.
55. A Post Mortem was conducted and concluded that the cause of Caaliyah’s death was haemorrhage following a stab wound to the left lung. There were four sharp injuries to the back, one of which had entered the chest to strike the left lung, and six defensive cut injuries to the right forearm and left hand.
56. Yasir declined to answer questions in interview; instead he provided the following written statement:
- “I [Yasir] have asked my solicitor to read out the following on my behalf:
I have been arrested in relation to an allegation of the Murder of my sister [Caaliyah], I deny the allegation.
In brief my sister and I had a verbal argument in the evening of [date of the homicide]. She became aggressive and threatened me with a kettle of boiling water. I managed to take the kettle from her and it dropped to the floor. I did not want to argue or fight. I walked away from her but she ran towards me with a kitchen knife. I tried to defend myself and there was a physical struggle between us and I tried to disarm her. During the struggle my right hand/fingers were injured by the knife. We fell to the floor and I got up. My sister was bleeding from an injury on her neck and back. I was bleeding from my right hand. I don’t know exactly how she got injured; I never intended to injure her.
I opened the front door and called out “help” at least twice. I left the door open and went back to my sister. I called 999 and asked for an ambulance. I followed instructions in trying to assist my sister”*
57. At his trial in June 2015, he advanced a defence of ‘self-defence’. This was not accepted by the Jury, but nor did they find that he had intended to kill or cause serious harm to his sister, so he was acquitted of murder and found guilty of manslaughter. He was sentenced to 14 years’ imprisonment. In sentencing, the trial Judge did not make any remarks relevant for this review.

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

ANALYSIS

58. Caaliyah arrived in the UK from Somalia in 1999 and had lived mostly a solitary and peaceful life in the London Borough of Tower Hamlets for the past 15 years. When her mother was alive, she would visit the family home in Burmantofts, Leeds and occasionally also to access medical services there accompanied by her elder brother, Aaden. She was clearly devoted to her Sunni Muslim faith.
59. Caaliyah was slight in stature and had suffered chronic musculoskeletal pain for most of her life, no doubt exacerbated by two separate falls when a bus passenger earlier in 2014, and from vitamin D deficiency for which she received supplements. In February 2009, she accepted a police caution for causing damage to the jacket of a ticket inspector when he had confiscated her freedom pass that, for some unknown reason, had been disabled and she was attempting to retrieve it.
60. Her younger brother, Yasir, had travelled to join the family in Leeds 10 years later in 2009 and it seems that he had been injured as well as traumatised by the civil war in Somalia and consequently suffered from mental health symptoms, such as depression, anxiety and short temper [Note: the source for this is Aaden and the information is not confirmed by a clinician].
61. There had been three low level incidents at the family home in Leeds during 2010-11 known to the police, one involving the two of them, one between Yasir and their elder brother Aaden that Caaliyah witnessed and another with just the two brothers. None of the incidents involved violence although it had been threatened. The common denominator was Yasir.
62. The only connection between these events and the death of Caaliyah is the reference to boiling water in the original call to police by Yasir for the second incident in July 2011 [that was not repeated to the officers that attended so not recorded by them] and his self-defence case for the murder charge that, in any event, was not accepted by the trial Jury.
63. Following the demise of their mother, Caaliyah's elder brother, Aaden, had moved to a neighbouring London Borough in August 2014. And when Yasir subsequently broke up with his partner in Leeds, he too came to London in late December and moved in with Caaliyah for the five days before her death.
64. The next day Yasir sought housing from local services, saying that he was homeless having broken up with his partner in Leeds. He provided Caaliyah's address as his temporary location with friends and did not disclose it was his sister's home. He did not meet the necessary criteria for homelessness.
65. The visit had started badly with an argument between him and Aaden at Kings Cross Station and Caaliyah reported to Aaden at Friday prayers that the stay was not working; moreover, Yasir had uttered a threat to kill her rather than move out. Aaden spoke to his brother who promised to calm down and be respectful to his sister and acknowledge the fact that he was a guest at her home.
66. By the next day (Saturday), the situation had become intolerable for Caaliyah and she informed Aaden by telephone that she had issued an ultimatum or 'deadline' to Yasir that he should be out of her flat by the following Monday morning. In turn, Yasir told his brother that he would

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

seek alternative accommodation the next day. Later that evening, apparently during the continuing dispute, Yasir inflicted fatal stab wounds on Caaliyah.

67. None of these developments were reported or known to safeguarding agencies in Tower Hamlets until the emergency call from Yasir late on the Saturday evening to report that Caaliyah had been fatally injured. Despite sustained efforts by paramedics and the HEMS doctors, Caaliyah's injuries were so severe she was beyond saving.

CONCLUSIONS AND LESSONS LEARNED

68. In arriving at conclusions and seeking to understand the lessons learned, the Panel has examined the available evidence for and against concluding that Caaliyah had been subjected to a family or community culture conducive to domestic abuse or controlling and coercive behaviour [see paragraphs 15-18 above for rationale].
69. Taken together, the three relatively minor domestic incidents recorded in Leeds between December 2010 and August 2011 provide some learning with respect to the linking and classification of incidents:
- Two missed opportunities to make a notification or referral to Adult Social Care with respect to poor housing conditions in respect of their elderly mother
 - The second incident in July 2011 should have been recorded as a domestic incident [Note: The non-recording of domestic incidents has been identified from a previous DHR (post July 2011) and a recommendation implemented and reminders published on the Force intranet site as recently as August 2014]
 - A pattern of repeat incidents involving the family was not identified and appropriate supervisory oversight was not evident [Note: In September 2013, Leeds District Safeguarding Unit published a Staff Guidance Document which clearly details processes and procedures in respect of domestic abuse incident management]
70. Caayilah was involved in two of the incidents: one in the argument with Yasir in which he claimed it was she that was abusive; the other where she was witness to a domestic argument between her brothers. For both incidents, it is likely that she had been present to visit her mother because she had been living alone in Tower Hamlets for at least 10 years by this time. Although recorded as domestic incidents, there is nothing noted by police to indicate that Caaliyah had been subject of controlling or coercive behaviour leading to the police calls.
71. Following the HMIC national inspection of the management of domestic abuse reports in 2013, West Yorkshire Police implemented all seven recommendations made, including a review of training provided to Frontline Staff. The action plan remains with the Force Performance Improvement Unit under a dedicated Project Manager. The Force domestic abuse policy was reviewed during 2015.
72. It is felt that, even if the three incidents involving the family had been assessed more holistically by West Yorkshire Police and that they had alerted Leeds District Adult Social Care in respect of the siblings' mother, analysis could not have presaged the extreme domestic violence that

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

led to the death of Caaliyah at the hands of her younger brother in Tower Hamlets some three years later.

73. There is some evidence that Caaliyah looked to Aaden for language translation support while she was living in Tower Hamlets and he was in Leeds. For example, when referred to A&E for investigation of the cachectic diagnosis in May 2010 [prior to the arrival of Yasir], she travelled to Leeds and attended A&E there accompanied by Aaden. It is not known whether this is an example of control or support; nor whether declining the admission offered for investigations was by her choice or on his direction.
74. In the NHS records of multiple GP consultations from 1999 to 2014, there is one other occasion, in 2008, when Aaden is noted as being present. It was also recorded that he was visiting her from Leeds. There are frequent references to the provision of a translator and/or advocate when she accessed GP services.
75. Caaliyah was involved in two falls while travelling on a bus in 2014 and it is known that Aaden helped her to find legal support for her injury claims. He also assisted with the review of her bathing facilities by Adult Social Care in November that year.
76. On Aaden's account of the fateful five days in Tower Hamlets during December 2014, it is apparent that Yasir was exercising abuse, control and coercion over Caayilah. This included a threat that she would die if he had to leave her flat. Matters came to a head in the argument overheard by Aaden on the evening of the homicide and referred to Yasir's anger at being woken up by the sounds of Caaliyah cooking a meal. Caaliyah had had enough and she had set the following Monday as the time when Yasir should be gone from her flat. Aaden did manage to calm things down and secure a commitment from Yasir to look for alternative accommodation the next morning.
77. Nothing of this was known to anyone in authority who could have acted on the abuse and threats. Other than Caaliyah herself her elder sibling, Aaden, was the only potential source of information to contact the police or other safeguarding agencies and it seems not to have occurred to him to alert anyone or seek advice. He may well have felt that matters had calmed and was possibly reassured by his brother's undertaking to seek alternative accommodation.
78. After the trial outcome, the view from the family of both victim and perpetrator as presented by Aaden is unequivocal, in that the focus should now be on the release of Yasir as the family has forgiven him for the homicide of Caaliyah. Cultural advice indicates that, within Islam, this is a particularly narrow view, more commonly to be held within the Somali community.
79. It is also thought that there would have been cultural pressure on Caaliyah to report any concerns to her elder brother for resolution, rather than seek advice or support outside of the family circle. This is apparent from her actions to manage her frustration with Yasir's physical presence in her home in those last few days of her life, supported by some evidence that she occasionally drew on Aaden's assistance with important medical matters whereby he would attend, ostensibly to translate for her, and with legal matters such as her bus injury claims.
80. It is not known if Caaliyah did confide her concerns beyond the family circle, for example, with sister worshippers at the London Muslim Centre and no information has emerged from the

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

inquiries made of that potential source. In any event, there is a question to be explored of what channels of communication and access to safeguarding services are available to anyone who did know of Caaliyah's predicament.

81. Due to the complete lack of awareness within agencies in Tower Hamlets that Caaliyah was in mortal danger from her brother, it can safely be concluded that there was no opportunity presented to safeguarding agencies to either predict or prevent her domestic violence homicide. Consequently, there are no individual or system failures identified from this review
82. Nonetheless, given Caaliyah's devotion to her faith, it may be appropriate to review the information available to women attending Mosques, specifically the London Muslim Centre, as to how to access domestic abuse services such as offered in the Tower Hamlets service directory, including when others may become concerned for the well-being of a sister worshipper.

RECOMMENDATIONS

83. The Individual Management Review from West Yorkshire Police has recommended that, learning from the three domestic incidents they were called to at Burmantofts, Leeds in 2010/11:

West Yorkshire Police ensures that all police officers and staff are reminded of the importance of making Adult Safeguarding notifications or referrals to Adult Social Care in circumstances where a Vulnerable Adult is known to be resident (full or part time) within an environment where domestic abuse is identified

84. For the subsequent events in London, the Panel is concerned to ensure that women in Tower Hamlets that find themselves in Caaliyah's circumstances, firstly, are aware that advice and support is available and, secondly, are sufficiently confident to access that advice and support. Moreover, family, friends and fellow worshippers should be able to report concerns via third party channels of communication.
85. In November 2013, Tower Hamlets Violence Against Women and Girls (VAWG) Strategy Manager provided domestic abuse training to the Imams at the London Muslim Centre, including suggestions for key messages to be included in sermons.
86. In November 2014, the Community Safety Partnership updated and published its protocol for Third Party Reporting of Hate Crime. The signatories to the protocol are Tower Hamlets Police Community Safety Unit and Tower Hamlets Borough Communities Service, together with eleven Third Party Reporting Centres, including the London Muslim Centre. It is felt that this review would provide an ideal case study to reinforce and promote the awareness of third party reporting to improve the safety of women and girls in Tower Hamlets.
87. More recently, the Mayor of Tower Hamlets has initiated a Somali Taskforce in the Borough and there will be an opportunity to prioritise VAWG training specifically within the Somali community at the London Muslim Centre.

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

88. Therefore, the following recommendation is made with respect to the Tower Hamlets experience of this review:

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership provide an outline of the learning from this review, suitably anonymised, to promote further the encouragement of personal and third party reporting of domestic abuse within Tower Hamlets, specifically within the Somali community

Author

Bill Griffiths CBE BEM QPM

13 December 2016

Glossary

ACPO	Association of Chief Police Officers
A&E	Accident and Emergency
CAADA	Safe Lives - Coordinated Action Against Domestic Abuse
CCG	Clinical commissioning Group
cjsm	Criminal Justice Secure eMail
CPS	Crown Prosecution Service
CSU	Community Safety Unit
DAAT	Drugs and Alcohol Team
DA	Domestic Abuse
DASH	Domestic Abuse, Stalking and 'Honour'-based violence
DV	Domestic Violence
DHR	Domestic Homicide Review
DVHR	Domestic Violence Homicide Review
GP	General Medical Practitioner
gsi	Government Secure Internet
HEMS	Helicopter Emergency Medical Service
HMIC	Her Majesty's Inspector of Constabulary
HOST	Housing Options Singles Team
IDVA	Independent Domestic Violence Advocate
IMR	Independent Management Review
IO	Investigating Officer
IPCC	Independent Police Complaints Commission
LB	London Borough
LBTH	London Borough of Tower Hamlets
LMC	London Muslim Centre
MAPPA	Multi Agency Public Protection Arrangements
MARAC	Multi Agency Risk Assessment Conference
MPS	Metropolitan Police Service
NHS	National Health Service
PNC	Police National Computer
pnn	Police National Network
SCR	Serious Case Review
SIO	Senior Investigating Officer
SOP	Standard Operating Procedure
ToR	Terms of Reference
VAWG	Violence Against Women and Girls
WYP	West Yorkshire Police

Pseudonyms

Victim	Caaliyah D
Perpetrator	Yasir Z
Elder brother	Aaden B
Sister	Faduma E

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

Distribution List

Name	Agency	Position/ Title
Will Tuckley	LB Tower Hamlets	Chief Executive
Shiria Khatun	LB Tower Hamlets	Councillor for Community Safety and lead on domestic abuse
Andy Bamber	LB Tower Hamlets	Head of Community Safety Service
Menara Ahmed	LB Tower Hamlets	Manager of Domestic Violence and Hate Crime Team Manager
Janet Slater	LB Tower Hamlets	Service Manager, Housing Options
Alan Tyrer	LB Tower Hamlets	Safeguarding & MCA Coordinator, Adult Social Care
Racheal Sadegh	LB Tower Hamlets	DAAT Coordinator
Clare Belgard	LB Tower Hamlets	Interim Head of Service, Youth & Community Learning
Shazia Ghani	LB Tower Hamlets	Head of Community Safety
Dr Somen Banerjee	LB Tower Hamlets	Interim Director of Public Health
Dr Angela Lennox	NHS England	Associate Medical Director
Dr Robert Dolan	North East London NHS Foundation Trust	Chief Executive
Samantha Millar	West Yorkshire Police	Superintendent, Community Safety
Andy Ewing	Metropolitan Police	Borough Commander
Chris Brown	Metropolitan Police	Detective Sergeant Specialist Crime Review Group
Simon Dilkes	Metropolitan Police	Detective Chief Inspector
Claire Steadman	Metropolitan Police	Homicide Command case officer
Jane Callaghan	Barts Health	[Awaits]
Karen Sobey Hudson	NHS England	Patient Safety Projects Manager (London Region)
John Azah	Kingston Race and Equalities Council	Chief Executive Officer
Clare Williamson	Victim Support	East Area Manager
Bill Griffiths	Independent Chair	Independent Chair of the Domestic Homicide Review
Tony Hester	Director Sancus Solutions Ltd	Independent Administrator and Panel Secretary
Quality Assurance Panel	Home Office	-
Baljit Ubhey	Crown Prosecution Service	London Chief Crown Prosecutor

Independence statements

Chair of Panel

Bill Griffiths CBE BEM QPM was appointed by Tower Hamlets CSP as Independent Chair of the DVHR Panel and is the author of the report. He is a former Metropolitan police officer with 38 years operational service and an additional five years as police staff in the role of Director of Leadership Development, retiring in March 2010. He served mainly as a detective in both specialist and generalist investigation roles at New Scotland Yard and in the Boroughs of Westminster, Greenwich, Southwark, Lambeth and Newham.

As a Deputy Assistant Commissioner he implemented the Crime and Disorder Act for the MPS, leading to the Borough based policing model, and developed the critical incident response and homicide investigation changes arising from the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry. For the last five years of police service, as Director of Serious Crime Operations, he was responsible for the work of some 3000 operational detectives on all serious and specialist crime investigations and operations in London (except for terrorism) including homicide, armed robbery, kidnap, fraud and child abuse.

Bill has since set up his own company to provide consultancy, coaching and speaking services specialising in critical incident management, leadership development and strategic advice/review within the public sector.

During and since his MPS service he has had no personal or operational involvement within the Borough of Tower Hamlets, or direct management of any MPS employee. In the early 1990's he had contact with the Investigating officer dealing with the criminal investigation who was at that time a patrolling constable.

Secretary to Panel

Tony Hester has over 30 year's Metropolitan police experience in both Uniform and CID roles that involved Borough policing and Specialist Crime investigation in addition to major crime and critical incidents as a Senior Investigating Officer (SIO). This period included the management of murder and serious crime investigation.

Upon retirement in 2007, Tony entered the commercial sector as Director of Training for a large recruitment company. He now owns and manages an Investigations and Training company.

His involvement in this DVHR has been one of administration and support to the Independent Chair, his remit being to record the minutes of meetings and circulate documents securely as well as to act as the review liaison point for the Chair.

Other than through this review, Tony has no personal or business relationship or direct management of anyone else involved.

Panel Members

Name	Agency/Role
Sharmeen Narayan	LBTH Domestic Violence and Hate Crime Team (to October 2015)
Menara Ahmed	LBTH Domestic Violence and Hate Crime Team (from October 2015)
Janet Slater	LBTH Housing Options
Simon Dilkes	MPS LB Tower Hamlets, Detective Chief Inspector
Chris Brown	MPS Specialist Crime Review Group, Detective Sergeant
Samantha Millar	West Yorkshire Police, Superintendent
Bill Griffiths	Independent Chair
Tony Hester	Independent Administrator and Panel Secretary
Dr Angela Lennox	NHS England Associate Medical Director
Jane Callaghan	Barts Health
Alan Tyrer	LBTH Adult Social Care
Racheal Sadegh	LBTH DAAT
Dinar Hussain	LBTH Youth & Community Services
Claire Steadman	MPS Homicide Command case officer
Emily Fieran Reed	LBTH Community Safety
John Azah	CEO Kingston Race and Equalities Council

Terms of Reference for Review

1. To identify the best method for obtaining and analysing relevant information, and over what period of time, in order to understand the most important issues to address in this review and ensure the learning from this specific homicide is understood and systemic changes implemented. [Note: With respect to the victim, the date she entered the UK (March 1999) and, for the accused, the date he entered the UK (November 2009) to the date of homicide (late December 2014). However, anything considered to be of relevance or significance prior to the time period⁷ to be included in chronology reports]
2. To identify the agencies and professionals that should constitute this Panel and those that should submit Individual Management Reviews (IMR) and agree a timescale for completion. The Panel will include an appropriate independent advisor on the Somalian/Islamic culture and a mental health specialist (see item 4 below)
3. To understand and comply with the requirements of the criminal investigation, any misconduct investigation and the Inquest processes and identify any disclosure issues and how they shall be addressed, including arising from the publication of a report from this Panel.
4. To identify any relevant equality and diversity considerations arising from this case and whether either victim or alleged perpetrator was an ‘adult at risk’ and, if so, what specialist advice or assistance may be required. An initial discussion by the Panel has identified the following protected characteristics:
 - The victim is female
 - Both parties are Black African
 - Both are of Sunni Muslim faith
 - Each has a possible disability [Note: the victim is believed to be receiving occupational therapy assistance following a back injury and the defendant may have met the classification of ‘adult at risk’ due to mental health conditions; furthermore, there are some indications that the victim cannot yet be excluded from such an assessment]
5. To identify whether the victim was subject to a Multi-Agency Risk Assessment Conference (MARAC) or the alleged perpetrator subject to Multi-Agency Public Protection Arrangements (MAPPA) or Domestic Violence Perpetrator Programme (DVPP) and, if so, identify the terms of a Memorandum of Understanding with respect to disclosure of the minutes of meetings [Note: Preliminary assessment is that none of these processes apply in this review]
6. To determine whether this case meets the criteria for a Serious Case Review, as defined in Working Together to Safeguard the Child 2013, if so, how it could be best managed within this review [Note: Preliminary assessment is that there are no children involved in this review; however, it is thought that the provisions of the Care Act 2014 mean that the Panel should be open to the prospect of a Serious Adult Review]

⁷ For example, it is reported that the defendant was shot and injured in the leg aged 9 years at the same time his father was shot and killed in the context of the war situation prevailing in Somalia

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

7. To identify how should family, friends and colleagues of the victim and other support networks (and where appropriate, the perpetrator) contribute to the review and how matters concerning them in the media are managed during and after the review⁸.
8. To identify how the review should take account of previous lessons learned in Tower Hamlets and also from relevant agencies and professionals working in other Local Authority areas
9. To keep these terms of reference under review and subject of reconsideration in the light of any new information emerging

Operating Principles

- a. The aim of this review is to identify and learn lessons so that future safeguarding services improve their systems and practice for increased safety of potential and actual victims of domestic violence (as defined by the Home Office – see below)
- b. The aim is not to apportion blame to individuals or organisations, rather, it is to use the study of this case to provide a window on the system
- c. A forensic and non-judgmental appraisal of the system will aid understanding of what happened, the context and contributory factors and what lessons may be learned
- d. The review findings will be independent, objective, insightful and based on evidence while avoiding 'hindsight bias' and 'outcome bias' as influences
- e. The review will be guided by humanity, compassion and empathy with the victim's voice at the heart of the process
- f. It will take account of the protected characteristics listed in the Equality Act 2010
- g. All material will be handled within Government Security Classifications at 'Official - Sensitive' level

Definition of Domestic Abuse⁹

Any incident or pattern of incidents of controlling, coercive or threatening behaviour, violence or abuse between those aged 16 or over who are or have been intimate partners or family members regardless of gender or sexuality. This can encompass, but is not limited to, the following types of abuse:

- psychological
- physical
- sexual
- financial
- emotional

Controlling behaviour is: a range of acts designed to make a person subordinate and/or dependent by isolating them from sources of support, exploiting their resources and capacities for personal

⁸ This version pending input from family, friends and others to be arranged through police family liaison

⁹ Updated and published in August 2013 by the Home Office

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

gain, depriving them of the means needed for independence, resistance and escape and regulating their everyday behaviour.

Coercive behaviour is: an act or a pattern of acts of assault, threats, humiliation and intimidation or other abuse that is used to harm, punish, or frighten their victim.

ACTION PLAN

Recommendation	Scope of recommendation	Action to take	Lead Agency	Key Milestones Achieved in enacting recommendations	Target Date	Date of completion and outcome
<p>1 West Yorkshire Police ensures that all police officers and staff are reminded of the importance of making Adult Safeguarding notifications or referrals to Adult Social Care in circumstances where a Vulnerable Adult is known to be resident (full or part time) within an environment where domestic abuse is identified</p>	<p>WYP</p>	<p>Briefing item to be placed on the West Yorkshire Police Intranet Site for the attention of all staff.</p> <p>Separate briefing item to be sent to all Detective Inspectors in the District Safeguarding Units for the attention of all the Safeguarding Staff</p>	<p>WYP</p>	<p>All West Yorkshire Police Staff will be reminded of the importance of making the appropriate notifications or referrals to Adult Social Care. This will ensure compliance with the West Yorkshire Police Domestic Abuse Policy</p>	<p>January 2016</p>	<p>Intranet briefing published 21/12/2015</p> <p>Email sent to all the Safeguarding Detective Inspectors 21/12/2015</p> <p>Completed</p>
<p>2 Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership provide an outline of the learning from this review, suitably anonymised, to promote further the encouragement of</p>	<p>LBTH</p>	<p>Prioritise VAWG training at Mosques within Mayor's Somali Taskforce action plan</p> <p>Communications Team to</p>	<p>LBTH</p>	<p>VAWG training plan as key milestone in Mayor's Somali Taskforce action plan</p> <p>Anonymised case</p>	<p>February 2016</p> <p>April 2016</p>	<p>June 2016</p> <p>Completed</p>

Tower Hamlets Community Safety Partnership – DVHR Panel for Ms Caaliyah D

<p>personal and third party reporting of domestic abuse within Tower Hamlets, specifically within the Somali community</p>	<p>prepare anonymised case study based on the learning from this review (once approved by Home Office Quality Assurance Panel)</p>	<p>study training package approved by Somali Taskforce</p>	
	<p>Review database of existing Third Party Reporting (TPR) Centres and identify new TPR Centres available in Tower Hamlets to encourage the reporting of Domestic Abuse and Hate Crime</p>	<p>Liaison with potential additional TPR Centres, such as Queen Mary University and LBTH Youth Services, to negotiate establishment as additional TPR Centres</p>	<p>April 2016</p>
	<p>Provide training material for dissemination to Somali Taskforce VAWG training in Mosques and at TPRs</p>	<p>Provision of refreshed VAWG training to all Mosques and TPR Centres with contact information available at all Council buildings</p>	<p>April 2016</p>
	<p>Continue to promote TPR Project through dissemination of TPR leaflets and posters and within local media and forums</p>	<p>Commission four public awareness campaigns per annum promoting the Somali Taskforce and TPR projects</p>	<p>June 2016</p>